CAUTION: THIS DOCUMENT HAS NOT YET BEEN REVIEWED BY THE COUNTY CLERK. (See below.)

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

#### 20-129

# SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK COUNTY OF NEW YORK

\_\_\_\_\_

	:	Docket No.:
Broadwall Management Corp.,	:	
CP Associates LLC, Nassau Mall Plaza Associates LLC,	:	SUMMONS
3601 Turnpike Associates LLC, 250 Park LLC,	:	
488 Madison Avenue Associates LLC, 257 Park Avenue	:	
South Associates LLC, 257 Park Avenue Associates LLC,	:	The Plaintiffs designate
257 Park Avenue South Fee Owner LLC, 370 Seventh	:	New York County as the
Avenue Associates LLC, Seven Penn Associates LLC,	:	place of trial.
French Partners LLC, SPA_NY LLC, New York French	:	
Soundview LLC, 551 Fifth Avenue Co-Investors LLC,	:	The basis of venue are
New York French Building Co-Investors LLC,	:	multiple Plaintiff's principal
CIC_NY LLC, 10 South LaSalle Owner LLC,	:	places of business in
Madison LaSalle Partners LLC, Fulton Retail LLC,	:	New York County as detailed
Fulton Green Owner LLC, 645 North Michigan LLC,	:	in Plaintiffs' Complaint,
645 No. Michigan LLC/Nakash TIC, Nakash 645 North	:	including 370 7 <sup>th</sup> Avenue
Michigan LLC, 730 Franklin Building Owner LLC,	:	New York, New York
North Sheffield Associates LLC, 1151 Third Avenue	:	10001.
Associates LLC, RP Feil 57 LLC, RCGLV FT 200	:	
W 57 LLC, RCGLV 200 W 57 LLC, P200 Payroll LLC	:	
	:	
Plaintiffs,	:	
:		
-against-	:	
	:	
Affiliated FM Insurance Company	:	
	:	
Defendant.	:	

To the above-named Defendant:

**YOU ARE HEREBY SUMMONED** to appear in the Civil Court of the City of New York, County of New York at the office of the Clerk of the said Court at 111 Centre Street, New York, New York in the County of New York City and State of New York, within the time provided by law as noted below and to file your answer to the annexed complaint with the Clerk; upon your failure to answer, judgment will be taken against you for the relief demanded in the complaint, together with the costs of this action

1

This is a copy of a pleading filed electronically pursuant to New York State court rules (22 NYCRR §202.5-b(d)(3)(i)) which, at the time of its printout from the court system's electronic website, had not yet been reviewed and approved by the County Clerk. Because court rules (22 NYCRR §202.5[d]) authorize the County Clerk to reject filings for various reasons, readers should be aware that documents bearing this legend may not have been 1 of

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

Dated: New York, New York October 22, 2021

> WEG AND MYERS, P.C. Attorney for Plaintiff s Federal Plaza 52 Duane Street New York, New York 10007 (212) 227-4210

Defendants' Address: Affiliated FM Insurance Company 270 Central Avenue, Johnston, Rhode Island.

**NOTE:** The law provides that: (a) If this summons is served by its delivery to you personally within the City of New York, you must appear and answer within TWENTY days after such service; or (b) If this summons is served by delivery to any person other than you personally, or is served outside the City of New York, or by publication, or by any means other than personal delivery to you within the City of New York, you are allowed THIRTY days after proof of service thereof is filed with the Clerk of this Court within which to appear and answer.

Yours, etc.,

**WEG AND MYERS, P.C.** *Attorneys for Plaintiffs* 

By: <u>/s/ David J. Matulewicz-Crowley</u> David J. Matulewicz-Crowley, Esq. Federal Plaza 52 Duane Street, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor New York, New York 10007 (212) 227-4210

This is a copy of a pleading filed electronically pursuant to New York State court rules (22 NYCRR §202.5-b(d)(3)(i)) which, at the time of its printout from the court system's electronic website, had not yet been reviewed and approved by the County Clerk. Because court rules (22 NYCRR §202.5[d]) authorize the County Clerk to reject filings for various reasons, readers should be aware that documents bearing this legend may not have been 2 of 26 accepted for filing by the County Clerk.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

#### 20-129 SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK

COUNTY OF NEW YORK

\_\_\_\_\_

Dere dere 11 Manual Com	: Docket No.:
Broadwall Management Corp., CP Associates LLC, Nassau Mall Plaza Associates LLC,	: COMPLAINT
3601 Turnpike Associates LLC, 250 Park LLC,	. <u>COMPLAINT</u>
488 Madison Avenue Associates LLC, 257 Park Avenue	•
South Associates LLC, 257 Park Avenue Associates LLC,	Jury Demanded
257 Park Avenue South Fee Owner LLC, 370 Seventh	:
Avenue Associates LLC, Seven Penn Associates LLC,	:
French Partners LLC, SPA_NY LLC, New York French	:
Soundview LLC, 551 Fifth Avenue Co-Investors LLC,	:
New York French Building Co-Investors LLC,	:
CIC_NY LLC, 10 South LaSalle Owner LLC,	:
Madison LaSalle Partners LLC, Fulton Retail LLC,	:
Fulton Green Owner LLC, 645 North Michigan LLC,	:
645 No. Michigan LLC/Nakash TIC, Nakash 645 North	:
Michigan LLC, 730 Franklin Building Owner LLC,	
North Sheffield Associates LLC, 1151 Third Avenue	
Associates LLC, RP Feil 57 LLC, RCGLV FT 200	
W 57 LLC, RCGLV 200 W 57 LLC, P200 Payroll LLC	•
Plaintiffs,	• •
i iunitiiti,	•
-against-	•
	:
Affiliated FM Insurance Company	:
	:
Defendant.	:
	-

# **INTRODUCTION**

1. Plaintiffs, together with their managing agent Broadwall Management Corporation,

manage and/or own a large portfolio of real estate properties.

2. Like most property owners, in order to protect them from unforeseen losses,

Plaintiffs procured insurance in order to protect their assets against fortuitous losses.

3. Specifically, Plaintiffs procured an "all-risk" insurance policy bearing Policy No. KM9555, effective from May 15, 2019 to May 20, 2020 (hereinafter, the "Subject Policy") sold by Affiliated FM Insurance Company (hereinafter, "Affiliated FM"), which was in full force and effect when the Covid-19 pandemic began to sweep through the nation.

4. The effect of the Covid-19 pandemic has been to cause serious economic losses to high-volume commercial property and retail businesses as a result of the presence of the Covid-19 virus within the various locations for which business owners, such as the Plaintiffs, have sought to insure.

5. The inundation of SARS-CoV-2 within the confined spaces of these properties resulted in the physical loss or damage suffered by these premises.

6. Further, in response to this widespread physical loss or damage caused by the effects of theCovid-19 virus, and to protect the public from further harm arising from exposure to areas infected by this virus, states and municipalities issued various orders targeting various types of commercial properties, including the properties owned by Plaintiffs and insured by the Subject Policy.

7. By way of example, the State of New York and New York City; the State of Illinois and City of Chicago; the District of Columbia; and the State of Indiana and City of Fort Wayne all issued closure orders in response to physical loss or damage caused by Covid-19.

8. These closure orders, and ones similar to them, together with the presence of airborne virus within the premises owned or leased by the Plaintiffs, resulted in Plaintiffs' tenants stoppage of rental payments due to their inability to utilize the space for which the space was intended and for which they were the lessee. As a result Plaintiffs have suffered substantial economic damages.

9. Plaintiffs fully expected that, in light of the all-encompassing all-risk policy of insurance issued to them by Defendant, Defendant would be responsive to their insurance claim.

10. Defendant's failure to provide Plaintiffs with coverage for losses sustained due to the outbreak of Covid-19 has forced Plaintiffs to bring this litigation.

## PARTIES

11. At all times hereinafter mentioned, Broadwall Management Corp. is a domestic corporation duly organized and existing under and by virtue of the laws of New York, having its principal place of business at 370 7th Avenue, New York, New York 10001.

12. Upon information and belief, at all times hereinafter mentioned, CP Associates, LLC, is a domestic limited liability company duly organized and existing under and by virtue of the laws of the State of New York and having its principal place of business as Concourse Plaza, 200-238 East 161<sup>st</sup> Street, Bronx, New York 10451.

13. Upon information and belief, at all times hereinafter mentioned, Nassau Mall Plaza Associates LLC, is a domestic limited liability company duly organized and existing under and by virtue of the laws of the State of New York and having its principal place of business at 3601 Hempstead Turnpike, Levittown, New York 11756.

14. Upon information and belief, at all times hereinafter mentioned, 3601 Turnpike Associates LLC is a domestic limited liability company duly organized and existing under and by virtue of the laws of the State of New York and having its principal place of business at 3601 Hempstead Turnpike, Levittown, New York 11756.

15. Upon information and belief, at all times hereinafter mentioned, 250 Park, LLC is a domestic limited liability company duly organized and existing under and by virtue of the laws of the State of New York and having its principal place of business at 250 Park Avenue, New York, New York 10177

16. Upon information and belief, at all times hereinafter mentioned, 488 Madison Avenue Associates LLC aka 488 Madison Avenue Associates aka 488 Sub-Tenants Association is a domestic limited liability company duly organized and existing under and by virtue of the laws of the State of New York and having its principal place of business at 488 Madison Avenue, New York, New York 10022.

17. Upon information and belief, at all times hereinafter mentioned, 257 Park Avenue South Associates is a domestic limited liability company duly organized and existing under and by virtue of the laws of the State of New York and having its principal place of business at 257 Park Avenue, New York, New York 10167.

18. Upon information and belief, at all times hereinafter mentioned, 257 Park Avenue Associates is a domestic limited liability company duly organized and existing by virtue of the laws of the State of New York and having its principal place of business at 257 Park Avenue, New York, New York 10167.

19. Upon information and belief, at all times hereinafter mentioned, 257 Park Avenue South Fee Owner, LLC is a domestic limited liability company organized and existing by virtue of the laws of the State of New York and having its principal place of business at 257 Park Avenue, New York, New York 10167.

20. Upon information and belief, at all times hereinafter mentioned, 370 Seventh Avenue Associates, LLC is a domestic corporation duly organized and existing under and by virtue of the laws of the State of New York and having its principal place of business at 370 Seventh Avenue, New York, New York 10001.

21. Upon information and belief, at all times hereinafter mentioned, 370 Seventh Avenue Fee Owner LLC is a domestic limited liability company duly organized and existing under and by virtue of the laws of the State of New York and having its principal place of business at 370 Seventh Avenue, New York, New York 10001.

22. Upon information and belief, at all times hereinafter mentioned, Seven Penn Associates is a domestic limited liability company duly organized and existing under and by virtue of the laws of the State of New York and having its principal place of business at 370 Seventh Avenue, New York, New York 10001.

23. Upon information and belief, at all times hereinafter mentioned, French Partners LLC is a domestic limited liability company duly organized and existing under and by virtue of the laws of the State of New York and having its principal place of business at 551 5th Avenue, New York, New York 10017.

24. Upon information and belief, at all times hereinafter mentioned, SPA\_NY LLC is a domestic limited liability company duly organized and existing under and by virtue of the laws of the State of New York and having its principal place of business at 551 5th Avenue, New York, New York 10001.

25. Upon information and belief, at all times hereinafter mentioned, New York French Soundview LLC is a domestic limited liability company duly organized and existing under and by virtue of the laws of the State of New York and having its principal place of business at 551 5th Avenue, New York, New York 10001.

26. Upon information and belief, at all times hereinafter mentioned, New York 551 Fifth Avenue Co-Investors LLC is a domestic limited liability company duly organized and existing under and by virtue of the laws of the State of New York and having its principal place of business at 551 5th Avenue, New York, New York 10001.

27. Upon information and belief, at all times hereinafter mentioned, New York French Building Co-Investors LLC is a domestic limited liability company duly organized and existing under and by virtue of the laws of the State of New York and having its principal place of business at 551 5th Avenue, New York, New York 10001.

28. Upon information and belief, at all times hereinafter mentioned, CIC-NY, LLC is a domestic limited liability company duly organized and existing under and by virtue of the laws of the State of New York and having its principal place of business at 551 5th Avenue, New York, New York 10001.

29. Upon information and belief, at all times hereinafter mentioned, 10 South LaSalle Owner, LLC is a foreign limited liability company duly organized and existing under and by virtue of the laws of the State of Illinois and having its principal place of business at 10 South LaSalle Street, Chicago, Illinois 60603.

30. Upon information and belief, at all times hereinafter mentioned, Madison LaSalle Partners LLC is a foreign limited liability company duly organized and existing under and by virtue of the laws of the State of Illinois and having its principal place of business at 10 South LaSalle Street, Chicago, Illinois 60603.

31. Upon information and belief, at all times hereinafter mentioned, Fulton Retail, LLC is a foreign limited liability company duly organized and existing under and by virtue of the laws of the State of Illinois and having its principal place of business at 813-26 West Fulton Market, Chicago, Illinois 60607.

32. Upon information and belief, at all times hereinafter mentioned, Fulton Green Owner, LLC is a foreign limited liability company duly organized and existing under and by virtue of the laws of the State of Illinois and having its principal place of business at 813-26 West Fulton Market, Chicago, Illinois 60607.

33. Upon information and belief, at all times hereinafter mentioned, 645 No. Michigan, LLC/Nakash TIC is a foreign limited liability company duly organized and existing under and by virtue of the laws of the State of Illinois and having its principal place of business at 645 North Michigan Avenue, Chicago, Illinois 60611.

34. Upon information and belief, at all times hereinafter mentioned, 645 North Michigan LLC is a foreign limited liability company duly organized and existing under and by virtue of the laws of the State of Illinois and having its principal place of business at 645 North Michigan Avenue, Chicago, Illinois 60611.

35. Upon information and belief, at all times hereinafter mentioned, Nakash 645 North Michigan, LLC is a foreign limited liability company duly organized and existing under and by virtue of the laws of the State of Illinois and having its principal place of business at 645 North Michigan Avenue, Chicago, Illinois 60611.

36. Upon information and belief, at all times hereinafter mentioned, 730 Franklin Building Owner, LLC is a foreign limited liability company duly organized and existing under and by virtue of the laws of the State of Illinois and having its principal place of business at 730 North Franklin Street, Chicago, Illinois 60654.

37. Upon information and belief, at all times hereinafter mentioned, North Sheffield Associates, LLC is a foreign limited liability company duly organized and existing under and by virtue of the laws of the State of Illinois and having its principal place of business at 938 West North Avenue, Chicago, Illinois 60622.

38. Upon information and belief, at all times hereinafter mentioned, 1151 Third Avenue Associates, LLC is domestic limited liability company duly organized and existing under and by virtue of the laws of the State of New York and having its principal place of business at 1151 3rd Avenue, New York, New York 10065.

39. Upon information and belief, at all times hereinafter mentioned, RP Feil 57, LLC is a domestic limited liability company duly organized and existing under and by virtue of the laws of the State of New York and having its principal place of business at 200 West 57th Street, New York, New York 10019.

40. Upon information and belief, at all times hereinafter mentioned, RCGLV FT 200 W 57, LLC is a domestic limited liability company duly organized and existing under and by virtue of the laws of the State of New York and having its principal place of business at 200 West 57th Street, New York, New York 10019.

41. Upon information and belief, at all times hereinafter mentioned, RCGLV 200 W57 LLC is a domestic limited liability company duly organized and existing under and by virtue of the laws of the State of New York and having its principal place of business at 200 West 57th Street, New York, New York 10019.

42. Upon information and belief, at all times hereinafter mentioned, RP/Feil 57 LLC is a domestic limited liability company duly organized and existing under and by virtue of the laws of the State of New York and having its principal place of business at 200 West 57th Street, New York, New York 10019.

Upon information and belief, at all times hereinafter mentioned, P200 Payroll LLC 43. is a domestic limited liability corporation duly organized and existing under and by virtue of the laws of domestic limited liability company duly organized and existing under and by virtue of the laws of the State of New York and having its principal place of business at 200 West 57th Street, New York, New York 10019.

44. Upon information and belief, at all times hereinafter mentioned, Defendant AFFILIATED FM INSURANCE COMPANY (hereinafter referred to as "Defendant or "Affiliated FM") was and is a foreign corporation organized and existing under and by virtue of the laws of Rhode Island, having its principal place of business at 270 Central Avenue, Johnston, Rhode Island.

#### THE NOVEL CORONAVIRUS AND ITS EFFECTS

45. It is beyond cavil that at all relevant times the world was experiencing a global pandemic from a disease caused by a novel coronavirus (specifically, SARS-CoV-2) and commonly referred to as Covid-19.

46. From as early as December 2019, Covid-19 began spreading, first in China and then, because the disease is highly contagious, rapidly around the globe.

47. On January 30, 2020, the World Health Organization ("WHO") declared that the Covid-19 outbreak constituted a public health emergency of international concern.

48. The World Health Organization ("WHO") stated that "[t]he disease spreads primarily from person to person through small droplets from the nose or mouth, which are expelled when a person with COVID-19 coughs, sneezes, or speaks . . . People can catch COVID-19 if they breathe in these droplets from a person infected with the virus . . . These droplets can land on objects and surfaces around the person such as tables, doorknobs and handrails. People can become infected by touching these objects or surfaces, then touching their eyes, nose or mouth."<sup>1</sup>

This is a copy of a pleading filed electronically pursuant to New York State court rules (22 NYCRR §202.5-b(d)(3)(i)) which, at the time of its printout from the court system's electronic website, had not yet been reviewed and approved by the County Clerk. Because court rules (22 NYCRR §202.5[d]) authorize the County Clerk to reject filings for various reasons, readers should be aware that documents bearing this legend may not have been 11 of 26 accepted for filing by the County Clerk.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>*Q&A on coronaviruses (COVID-19)*, World Health Organization,

https://web.archive.org/web/20200506094904/https://www.who.int/emergencies/diseases/novelcoronavirus-2019/question-and-answers-hub/q-a-detail/q-a-coronaviruses (last visited Mar. 20, 2021).

49. In addition, studies have verified that many individuals remain asymptomatic despite infection by COVID-19.<sup>2</sup> COVID-19 also includes a pre-symptomatic incubation period of up to 14 days, during which time infected people can transmit COVID-19 to people, into the air and onto surfaces without having experienced symptoms and without realizing that they are infected.<sup>3</sup> COVID-19 is not only highly contagious, but also deadly. In April 2020, 3 people staying at a Hotel in midtown Manhattan died of COVID-19. The Hotel is located less than a mile from numerous of Plaintiffs' insured properties claiming losses in the instant action

50. Consequently, while during this time period it was possible to identify certain individuals who were suffering from obvious symptoms of the coronavirus, given a lack of significant medical testing at the time, it was impossible to distinguish between infected and non-infected members of the general public. Additionally, the existence and/or presence of the Coronavirus and COVID-19 is not simply reflected in reported cases or individuals' positive test results. The Centers for Disease Control and Prevention ("CDC") estimates that the number of people in the U.S. who have been infected with COVID-19 is likely to be 10 times higher than the number of reported cases.<sup>4</sup>

51. Civil authority orders began to be issued by states and municipalities throughout March 2020.

52. The basis of these orders were all predicated, in part, on the effect of the presence of, and the physical loss or damage caused by Covid-19 within enclosed, highly trafficked locations.

This is a copy of a pleading filed electronically pursuant to New York State court rules (22 NYCRR §202.5-b(d)(3)(i)) which, at the time of its printout from the court system's electronic website, had not yet been reviewed and approved by the County Clerk. Because court rules (22 NYCRR §202.5[d]) authorize the County Clerk to reject filings for various reasons, readers should be aware that documents bearing this legend may not have been 12 of 26 accepted for filing by the County Clerk.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> See CDC, Jing Cai, Wenjie Sun, Jianping Huang, Michelle Gamber, Jing Wu, Guiqing He, Indirect Virus Transmission in Cluster of COVID-19 Cases, Wenzhou, China, 2020, 26 EMERGING INFECTIONS DISEASES 6 (June 2020), https://wwwnc.cdc.gov/eid/article/26/6/20-0412\_article (last visited Mar. 20, 2021).
<sup>3</sup> Id.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Lena H. Sun and Joel Achenbach, CDC chief says coronavirus cases may be 10 times higher than reported, WASH. POST (June 25, 2020), https://www.washingtonpost.com/health/2020/06/25/coronavirus-cases-10-times-larger/ (last visited Mar. 31, 2021).

53. For example, New York City Emergency Executive Order No. 100, issued March 16, 2020 stated that the order was issued "because the virus physically is causing property loss and damage."<sup>5</sup>

## **THE PHYSICAL IMPACTS OF COVID-19**

54. Given the nature of Plaintiffs' business, the spread of the Covid-19 virus led to significant economic damages.

55. These damages resulted from physical loss or damage to and from within Plaintiffs' insured premises as well as from premises within the vicinity of the insured locations.

56. SARS-CoV-2 is a physical substance and a human pathogen which can be present outside the body and is more likely to be transmitted indoors.

57. As a result, when people infected with Covid-19 cough, sneeze, talk or breath, they produce respiratory droplets, or "fomites" carrying SARS-CoV-2.

58. Not only is SARS-CoV-2 transmitted human-to-human, but the WHO and scientific studies have confirmed that the virus can remain infectious on objects and surfaces.

59. As noted above, COVID-19 spreads both through aerosols which linger for an extended period of time in the air of the space that an infected person has entered or passed through.

60. COVID-19 also spreads through physical droplets which land on surfaces rendering those surfaces damaged by converting those surfaces into a vehicle for further infection to other customers, employees or any other person who subsequently comes in contact with those physical droplets.

This is a copy of a pleading filed electronically pursuant to New York State court rules (22 NYCRR §202.5-b(d)(3)(i)) which, at the time of its printout from the court system's electronic website, had not yet been reviewed and approved by the County Clerk. Because court rules (22 NYCRR §202.5[d]) authorize the County Clerk to reject filings for various reasons, readers should be aware that documents bearing this legend may not have been 13 of 26 accepted for filing by the County Clerk.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> See The City of New York, Office of the Mayor, Emergency Executive Order No. 100, March 16, 2020.

61. Like many other threats to human health and life (for example, formaldehyde, radioactivity, carbon monoxide, and legionella) SARS-CoV-2 presents a threat to human life and health through the risk of contact with the virus on surfaces.

62. "Fomites" are physical objects or materials that carry, and are capable of transmitting infectious agents, altering these objects to become vectors of disease. Fomite transmission has been demonstrated for SARS-CoV-2, both from object-to-hand and from hand-to-mouth.<sup>6</sup>

63. At all relevant times, human beings have spread Covid-19 through the simple act of breathing in air that contains viral droplets. The New York Times has reported that "[a]n infected person talking for five minutes in poorly ventilated space can also produce as many viral droplets as one infectious cough.<sup>7</sup>

64. At all relevant times, such damage both existing on surfaces found within the insureds' and surrounding premises as well as in the breathable air circulating within the insureds' and surrounding premises.

65. Fomites physically alter the surface of property into a potentially deadly Coronavirus transmission device. A study published in the Journal of Epidemiology and Infection demonstrated that after lockdown in the United Kingdom, Coronavirus transmission via fomites may have contributed to as many as 25% of deaths in that region.<sup>8</sup>

This is a copy of a pleading filed electronically pursuant to New York State court rules (22 NYCRR §202.5-b(d)(3)(i)) which, at the time of its printout from the court system's electronic website, had not yet been reviewed and approved by the County Clerk. Because court rules (22 NYCRR §202.5[d]) authorize the County Clerk to reject filings for various reasons, readers should be aware that documents bearing this legend may not have been 14 of 26 accepted for filing by the County Clerk.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> See n.2 supra.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Yuliya Parshina-Kottas, Bedel Saget, Karthik Patanjali, Or Fleisher and Gabriel Gianordoli, *This 3-D Simulation Shows Why Social Distancing Is So Important*, New York Times (Apr. 14, 2020) https://www.nytimes.com/interactive/2020/04/14/science/coronavirus-transmission-cough-6-feet-ar-ul.html.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> A. Meiksin, *Dynamics of COVID-19 transmission including indirect transmission mechanisms: a mathematical analysis*, 148 EPIDEMIOLOGY & INFECTION e257, 1-7 (Oct. 2020), https://www.cambridge.org/core/journals/epidemiology-and-infection/article/dynamics-ofCOVID19-transmission-including-indirect-transmission-mechanisms-amathematicalanalysis/A134C5182FD44BEC9E2BA6581EF805D3 (last visited Mar. 20, 2021).

66. "Healthy individuals contacting contaminated surfaces as part of their daily routine allow transmission to happen from an infected person to a healthy person even though there is no direct contact."

67. According to a metanalysis of studies reported in The Royal Society, "aluminum surfaces allowed coronavirus to stay alive for 2-8 [hours]," other results indicated that "steel, stainless steel, glass, silicone rubber, PVC, ceramic and Teflon all allowed coronavirus to stay active for 5 days."<sup>9</sup>According to a study documented in The New England Journal of Medicine, Covid-19 was detectable in aerosols for up to 3 hours, up to 4 hours on copper, up to 24 hours on cardboard, and up to 3 days on plastic and stainless steel.<sup>10</sup>

68. Indeed, scientific studies suggest that during the relevant time period set forth herein, individuals could contract Covid-19 through indirect contact with surfaces or objects used by an infected person, regardless of whether the infected person was symptomatic.

69. Accordingly, at all relevant timers, the presence of the Coronavirus in and on property, including in indoor air, on surfaces, and on objects, caused direct physical loss of or damage to property by causing harm to and altering property and otherwise making it incapable of being used for its intended purpose.

70. During the relevant time periods, removing COVID was difficult as well. A number of early studies found that the Coronavirus was much more resilient to cleaning than other respiratory viruses so tested.

This is a copy of a pleading filed electronically pursuant to New York State court rules (22 NYCRR §202.5-b(d)(3)(i)) which, at the time of its printout from the court system's electronic website, had not yet been reviewed and approved by the County Clerk. Because court rules (22 NYCRR §202.5[d]) authorize the County Clerk to reject filings for various reasons, readers should be aware that documents bearing this legend may not have been 15 of 26 accepted for filing by the County Clerk.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> M. Aydogdu, E. Altun, E. Chung, G. Ren, S. Homer-Vanniasinkam, B. Chen and M. Edirsinghe, *Surface interactions and viability of coronaviruses*, Journal of the Royal Society (Jan. 6, 2021), https://doi.org/10.1098/rsif.2020.0798 (last visited October 5, 2021).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Neeltje van Foremalen, Trenton Bushmaker, Dylan H. Morris, Myndi G Holbrook, Amandine Gamble, Brandi N. Williamson, Azaibi Tamin, Jennifer L. Harcourt, Natalie J. Thornburg, Susan I. Gerber, James O. Lloyd-Smith, Emmie de Wit, and Vincent J. Munster, *Aerosol and Surface Stability of SARS-CoV-2 as Compared with SARS-Cov-1*, The New England Journal of Medicine (Mar. 17, 2020), <u>https://www.nejm.org/doi/full/10.1056/nejmc2004973</u>

71. Furthermore, during the relevant subject period, because Covid-19 physically affected surfaces of property and the air and could be transferred to individuals that come into contact with the surface or the air of the property, causing additional infections, effective response to the Covid-19 pandemic required measures designed to reduce human to human contact along with surface to human contact.

72. As a result, at all relevant times, the presence of Sars-CoV-2 caused physical loss or damage to commercial space.

73. Additionally, the CDC recognized the importance of heating, ventilation and air conditioning ("HVAC") improvements prior to reoccupying buildings. According to the CDC, "[p]rotective ventilation practices and interventions can reduce the airborne concentrations and reduce the overall viral dose to occupants." For that reason, the CDC recommended that building owners and operators make various physical modifications to their HVAC systems to reduce exposure to the virus on their properties and the spread of COVID-19.<sup>11</sup>

74. Like many other threats to human health and life (for example, formaldehyde, radioactivity, or carbon monoxide) at all relevant times, SARS-CoV-2 presented a threat to human life and health through the risk of contact with the virus on surfaces.

#### PLAINTIFFS' INSURANCE POLICY AND CLAIM

75. The commencement of this lawsuit results from a breach of insurance contract arising from the failure of Affiliated FM to provide payment to Plaintiffs for their losses resulting from the global pandemic commonly referred to as coronavirus beginning on or about March 20, 2020, resulting in an economic loss that was first realized on or about April 1, 2020.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> CDC Guidance with respect to Ventilation in Buildings (June 2, 2021), <u>https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/community/ventilation.html</u> (citing Laurence J. Schoen, P.E., Guidance for Building Operations During the COVID-19 Pandemic, American Society of Heating, Refrigerating and Air-Conditioning Engineers Journal (May 2020)).

This is a copy of a pleading filed electronically pursuant to New York State court rules (22 NYCRR §202.5-b(d)(3)(i)) which, at the time of its printout from the court system's electronic website, had not yet been reviewed and approved by the County Clerk. Because court rules (22 NYCRR §202.5[d]) authorize the County Clerk to reject filings for various reasons, readers should be aware that documents bearing this legend may not have been 16 of 26 accepted for filing by the County Clerk.

76. On or before May 15, 2019, for good and valuable consideration, Plaintiffs procured a policy of insurance from Affiliated FM (the "Subject Policy") bearing policy number KM955.

77. The Subject Policy provides coverage for, *inter alia*, physical loss or damages, as well as losses of income due to business interruption.

78. The Subject Policy bears effective dates from May 15, 2019 to May 15, 2020.

79. The Subject Policy was in full force and effect as of March, 2020 and for the period

of time immediately thereafter.

80. The insuring clause of the Subject Policy provides in relevant part:

This Policy covers property, as described in this Policy, against ALL RISKS OF PHYSICAL LOSS OR DAMAGE, except as hereinafter excluded, while located as described in this Policy.

81. The Subject Policy further provides coverage for losses resulting from interruption

to Plaintiffs' business, Specifically:

## **B. BUSINESS INTERRUPTION COVERAGE**

3. Rental Income

The recoverable Rental Income is the actual loss sustained by the Insured of the following during the Period of Liability:

- a) The fair rental value of any portion of the property occupied by the Insured;
- b) Income reasonably expected from the rentals of unoccupied or unrented portions of such property;
- c) The rental income from the rented portions of such property, according to bona fide leases, contracts or agreements, in force at the time of the loss.

This is a copy of a pleading filed electronically pursuant to New York State court rules (22 NYCRR §202.5-b(d)(3)(i)) which, at the time of its printout from the court system's electronic website, had not yet been reviewed and approved by the County Clerk. Because court rules (22 NYCRR §202.5[d]) authorize the County Clerk to reject filings for various reasons, readers should be aware that documents bearing this legend may not have been 17 of 26 accepted for filing by the County Clerk.

82. The Subject Policy provides Business Interruption Coverage Extensions specifically:

(2) Civil or Military Authority

This Policy covers the Business Interruption Coverage loss incurred by the Insured during the Period of Liability if an order of civil or military authority prohibits access to a **location** provided such order is the direct result of physical damage if the type insured at a **location** or within five (5) statute miles of it.

(3) Communicable Disease – Business Interruption

If a described location owned, leased or rented by the Insured has the actual not suspected presence of communicable disease and access to such described location is limited, restricted or prohibited by:

- a) an order of an authorized governmental agency regulating such presence of communicable disease;
- b) A decision of an Officer of the Insured as a result of such presence of communicable disease.
   This Policy covers the Business Interruption Coverage loss incurred by the Insured during the Period of Liability at such described location with such presence of communicable disease.
- (7) Extended Period of Liability

The Gross Earnings and Rental Income coverage is extended to cover the reduction in sales resulting from:

- a) The interruption of business as covered by Gross Earnings or Rental Income;
- b) For such additional length of time as would be required with the exercise of due diligence and dispatch to restore the Insured's business to the condition that would have existed had no loss happened; and
- c) Commencing with the date on which the liability of the Company for loss resulting from interruption of business

This is a copy of a pleading filed electronically pursuant to New York State court rules (22 NYCRR §202.5-b(d)(3)(i)) which, at the time of its printout from the court system's electronic website, had not yet been reviewed and approved by the County Clerk. Because court rules (22 NYCRR §202.5[d]) authorize the County Clerk to reject filings for various reasons, readers should be aware that documents bearing this legend may not have been 18 of 26

would terminate if this Business Interruption Coverage Extension had not been included in this Policy.

(8) Ingress/Egress

This Policy covers the Business Interruption Coverage loss incurred by the Insured due to the necessary interruption of the Insured's business when ingress to or egress from a described location(s) is physically prevented, either partially or totally, as a direct result of physical loss or damage of the type insured to property of the type insured whether or not at a described location.

83. No exclusion in the Policy applies to preclude or limit coverage for the actual presence of Covid-19 at or away from Plaintiffs' property, the physical loss and damage to the property/or the business interruption losses that have and will continue to result from the physical loss and damage to property. To the extent Defendant contends any exclusion(s) apply, such exclusions(s) are unenforceable.

84. On or about April 15, 2020, Affiliated FM issued requests for information consisting of a questionnaire to be filled out by the Plaintiff, asking for specific verified cases of Covid-19 on its premises.

85. Plaintiffs timely responded to this request and all later requests made by Defendant.

86. On or about June 16, 2020, Plaintiffs submitted a sworn statement in proof of loss, making a claim for \$18,869,447.00 for damages incurred between April 1, 2020 through May 6, 2020.

87. Pursuant to Insurance Law § 216.6, Affiliated FM had 15 business days to accept or reject Plaintiffs' claim.

88. In correspondence dated August 21, 2020, Affiliated FM adopted this position that it could "neither accept nor reject" Plaintiff's sworn statement in proof of loss and refused to provide coverage.

89. Affiliated FM's failure to provide coverage breached its obligations under the Subject Policy.

#### **PROPERTIES AFFECTED**

90. As detailed below, Plaintiffs are commercial landlords operating spaces leased to various businesses impacted by COVID-19 and the subsequent civil authority orders mandating the closure of such businesses.

91. Plaintiffs' businesses include, *inter alia*, gyms, department stores and restaurants businesses which are trafficked by high numbers of customers and which employ numerous personnel on-site in order to service those customers.

92. Owing in part to that high-volume customer traffic and the numerous employees present at each location, SARS-CoV-2 was physically present in each property in March 2020 at the time of the issuance of the various civil authority orders mandating the closure of such properties.

93. Consequently, Plaintiff experienced physical loss and damage to each of the following properties insured by the Subject Policy:

a. 551 5<sup>th</sup> Ave, New York, New York 10017; comprising a 38-story tower with public-facing commercial space on the ground floor situated in Midtown Manhattan. The tenants at the property include numerous commercial retailers directly impacted by the COVID-19 shutdown orders, including, *inter alia*, Tommy Bahama, Pace University. The nature of the operation of these tenants, which are dependent on the physical presence of customers in stores, resulted in the physical presence of SARS-CoV-2 in the properties impacted and resulting physical loss and damage. b. 10 South La Salle Street, Chicago, IL 60603; comprising a 37-floor tower and commercial center in downtown Chicago. The tenants include numerous commercial retailers and restaurants directly impacted by the COVID-19 shutdown orders, including, *inter alia*, Paper Source, Chipotle Mexican Grill, J & J Poke Bar, and Fifth Third Bank. The nature of the operation of these tenants, which are dependent on the physical presence of customers in stores, resulted in the physical presence of SARS-CoV-2 in the properties impacted and resulting physical loss and damage.

c. 645 North Michigan Avenue, Chicago, IL 60611; comprising a mid-rise office building with public-facing commercial space on the ground floor situated in Downtown Chicago. The tenants at the property include numerous commercial retailers and restaurant businesses directly impacted by the COVID-19 shutdown orders, including, *inter alia*, TGI Fridays and Tumi Stores. The nature of the operation of these tenants, which are dependent on the physical presence of customers in stores, resulted in the physical presence of SARS-CoV-2 in the properties impacted and resulting physical loss and damage.

d. 362-378 7<sup>th</sup> Avenue, New York, New York 10001; comprising a seventeenstory office building with public-facing commercial space on the ground floor situated in Midtown Manhattan. The tenants at the property include numerous commercial retailers and restaurant businesses directly impacted by the COVID-19 shutdown orders, including, *inter alia*, Starbucks, Sweetgreen and Sticky Fingers. The nature of the operation of these tenants, which are dependent on the physical presence of customers in stores, resulted in the physical presence of SARS-CoV-2 in the properties impacted and resulting physical loss and damage.

e. 257-265 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue, New York, New York 10014; comprising a mid-rise office building with public-facing commercial space on the ground floor situated in the Flatiron

District of Manhattan, New York, New York. The tenants at the property include numerous commercial retailers and restaurant businesses directly impacted by the COVID-19 shutdown orders, including, *inter alia*, Blue Bottle Coffee and the Fed Ex Store. The nature of the operation of these tenants, which are dependent on the physical presence of customers in stores, resulted in the physical presence of SARS-CoV-2 in the properties impacted and resulting physical loss and damage.

f. 3601 Hempstead Turnpike, Levittown, New York 11756; comprising an outdoor shopping center situated in Levittown, New York. The tenants at the property include numerous large commercial retailers and restaurant businesses directly impacted by the COVID-19 shutdown orders, including, *inter alia*, TGI Friday's, Kohls Department Store, PetSmart, Party City, GameStop, Sally Beauty Supply, and others. The nature of the operation of these tenants, which are dependent on the physical presence of customers in stores, resulted in the physical presence of SARS-CoV-2 in the properties impacted.

g. 200-238 East 161<sup>st</sup> Street, Bronx, New York 10451; comprising an outdoor shopping center situated in Bronx, New York. The tenants at the property include numerous commercial retailers and restaurant businesses directly impacted by the COVID-19 shutdown orders, including *inter alia*, Modell's Sporting Goods, KNAI Entertainment, Kidstown Retail Apparel, 161 Chicken, and Hibachi Buffet. The nature of the operation of these tenants, which are dependent on the physical presence of customers in stores, resulted in the physical presence of SARS-CoV-2 in the properties impacted and resulting physical loss and damage.

h. 200 West 57<sup>th</sup> Street, New York, New York 10019; is a 42-story office building with public facing retail and commercial space on the ground floor situated in the theatre district of Manhattan. This property is situated directly across from Carnegie Hall and tenants include various commercial retail and restaurant businesses directly impacted by the COVID-19 shutdown orders, including *inter alia*, FedEx Store, 57<sup>th</sup> Bakery, and Kenji Murase Salon. The nature of the operation of these tenants, which are dependent on the physical presence of customers in stores, resulted in the physical presence of SARS-CoV-2 in the properties impacted and resulting physical loss and damage.

i. 488 Madison Avenue and 250 Parke Avenue, New York, NY 10022; comprising a 25-story office building with public-facing retail and commercial space on the ground floor in Midtown Manhattan, New York, New York. This property is situated in close proximity to Grand Central terminal and tenants include various commercial retail and restaurant businesses directly impacted by the COVID-19 shutdown orders, including, *inter alia*, All Market Foods and Metro PCS, Naya Express, Bonobos Apparel, and Indochino Apparel. The nature of the operation of these tenants, which are dependent on the physical presence of customers in stores, resulted in the physical presence of SARS-CoV-2 in the properties impacted and resulting physical loss and damage.

j. 813, 821, 825 West Fulton Market, Chicago, Illinois 60607; comprising the Fulton Market retail space in Downtown Chicago. The tenants include various commercial retail and restaurant businesses directly impacted by the COVID-19 shutdown orders, including, *inter alia*, Urban Outfitters, Sweet Green, La Colombe Coffee, and Casper Sleep Retail. The nature of the operation of these tenants, which are dependent on the physical presence of customers in stores, resulted in the physical presence of SARS-CoV-2 in the properties impacted and resulting physical loss and damage.

k. 730 N. Franklin Street, Chicago, Illinois 60654; comprising a seven-story commercial retail space situated in the Northside of Chicago. The tenants include various

commercial retail businesses and fitness-related businesses directly impacted by the COVID-19 shutdown orders, including, inter alia, Artisan Pilates, Midwest Sports and Gallery Victor Armendariz. The nature of the operation of these tenants, which are dependent on the physical presence of customers in stores, resulted in the physical presence of SARS-CoV-2 in the properties impacted and resulting physical loss and damage.

1. 1151 Third Avenue, New York, New York 10065; comprising a five-story commercial retail space situated in Lenox Hill, Manhattan. The tenants include various commercial retail businesses directly impacted by the COVID-19 shutdown orders, including, *inter alia*, Vineyard Vines Retail and Flywheel Sports. The nature of the operation of these tenants, which are dependent on the physical presence of customers in stores, resulted in the physical presence of SARS-CoV-2 in the properties impacted and resulting physical loss and damage.

938 North Avenue, Chicago, Illinois 60622; comprising an indoor-outdoor m. shopping center and commercial retail space in the Lincoln Park neighborhood of Chicago. The tenants include, *inter alia*, commercial retail businesses directly impacted by the COVID-19 shutdown orders, including the largest Lululemon retail store in the world and Sephora. The nature of the operation of these tenants, which are dependent on the physical presence of customers in stores, resulted in the physical presence of SARS-CoV-2 in the properties impacted and resulting physical loss and damage.

# AS AND FOR A FIRST CAUSE OF ACTION AGAINST DEFENDANT (Breach of Contract)

94. Plaintiffs repeat and reallege paragraphs "1" through "93", with the same force and effect as if set forth at length herein.

95. The Subject Policy constituted a binding contract between Plaintiffs and Affiliated FM.

This is a copy of a pleading filed electronically pursuant to New York State court rules (22 NYCRR §202.5-b(d)(3)(i)) hich, at the time of its printout from the court system's electronic website, had not yet been reviewed and upproved by the County Clerk. Because court rules (22 NYCRR §202.5[d]) authorize the County Clerk to reject filings for various reasons, readers should be aware that documents bearing this legend may not have been accepted for filing by the County Clerk.

96. Plaintiffs have an insurable interest in each of the Subject Properties set forth in paragraph "99."

Plaintiffs complied with all of their obligations under the Subject Policy, including 97. through timely notification of a loss and the filing of a Sworn Statement in Proof of Loss.

98. To date, Affiliated FM has failed to compensate Plaintiffs for any of their losses which now total \$18,869,447.00.

99. Affiliated FM's failure to compensate Plaintiffs for their losses constitutes a breach of the Subject Policy.

100. As a result of Affiliated FM's breach of the Subject Policy, Plaintiffs have suffered damages in the amount of \$18,869,447.00 together with such additional and subsequent damages as may be incurred and proven at trial.

WHEREFORE, Plaintiffs demand judgment against Affiliated FM Insurance Company as follows:

- (a) On the First Cause of Action, a money judgment against Affiliated FM in the amount of \$18,869,447.00, together with such additional and subsequent damages as may be proven at trial;
- (b) Reasonable fees and costs of this action; and
- For such other and further relief as to which this Court deems just and proper. (c)

Dated: New York, New York October 22, 2021

Yours, etc.,

WEG AND MYERS, P.C. Attorneys for Plaintiffs

/s/ David J. Matulewicz-Crowley By:

This is a copy of a pleading filed electronically pursuant to New York State court rules (22 NYCRR §202.5-b(d)(3)(i)) which, at the time of its printout from the court system's electronic website, had not yet been reviewed and approved by the County Clerk. Because court rules (22 NYCRR §202.5[d]) authorize the County Clerk to reject filings for various reasons, readers should be aware that documents bearing this legend may not have been accepted for filing by the County Clerk.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

David J. Matulewicz-Crowley, Esq. Federal Plaza 52 Duane Street, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor New York, New York 10007 (212) 227-4210

This is a copy of a pleading filed electronically pursuant to New York State court rules (22 NYCRR §202.5-b(d)(3)(i)) which, at the time of its printout from the court system's electronic website, had not yet been reviewed and approved by the County Clerk. Because court rules (22 NYCRR §202.5[d]) authorize the County Clerk to reject filings for various reasons, readers should be aware that documents bearing this legend may not have been 26 of 26 accepted for filing by the County Clerk.